1. Call to Order

2. Attendance

3. Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes

4. Public Comment

5. Applications
   
   5A.1 – 318 Cutler Street

6. Staff Approvals

7. Other Business

8. Staff/Commission Comments

9. Adjournment

The minutes of this meeting will be available at City Hall, 112 Locust Street, and Allegan MI 49010 (269) 673-5511. The City of Allegan is an equal opportunity provider and employer.
I. Call to Order by Chair Jill Bentley at 7:00pm

II. Attendance

**PRESENT:** Chair Jill Bentley, Eddie Quinones-Walker, Traci Perrigo, Cassandra Howard

**ABSENT:** Vice Chair- Mike Morton, Rob Way, Brad Burke

**TARDY:** None

**STAFF:** Lori Castello- Zoning Administrator/Historic District Coordinator (PCI)

Eddie Quinones-Walker, supported by Traci Perrigo, made a motion to excuse Mike Morton, Rob Way, and Brad Burke from the meeting. Motion passed 4-0.

III. Approval of the Previous Meeting Minutes

Eddie Quinones-Walker, supported by Traci Perrigo, made a motion to approve the minutes from the November 5, 2018 meeting. Motion passed 4-0.

IV. Public Comment

None.

V. Applications

1. **229 Hubbard Street**

Lou Thierwechter, presented to the HDC, requesting for an approval for a partial replacement of windows on the second story of the Hubbard Street face of his building. Thierwechter proposed installing double hung vinyl windows for the bottom portion of three second story windows. The top halves would be preserved.

After some discussion, the HDC reached a general consensus that vinyl windows would not be appropriate for the building. They would prefer to see wood windows instead, with a total of two panes to mirror the windows see on the other downtown buildings in town.

Eddie Quinones-Walker, supported by Traci Perrigo, made a motion to deny the
request to install vinyl double hung windows at 229 Hubbard Street based on Secretary of Interior Standards 4, 5, and 6, as well as City of Allegan Preservation Standards 14 and 16. Motion carried 4-0.

RESULT: Denied (UNANIMOUS)
MOVER: Eddie Quinones-Walker
SECONDER: Traci Perrigo
YEAS: Bentley, Quinones-Walker, Perrigo, Howard

VI. Staff Approvals
   -None.

VII. Other Business
   -None.

X. Staff/Commission Comments

   Lori Castello of PCI explained that 411 Cutler Street had changed hands. She has sent a letter letting the property owners know that they are in a regulated district. An application was also included in the letter in case they are interested in making any improvements.

   Castello is also working on sending a letter to 201 Race Street.

   Castello also mentioned that Community Development Coordinator Jordan Meagher is working with the MHPN to identify new training opportunities for 2019.

   Jill Bentley mentioned that she would be absent from the January meeting if it occurs.

XI. Adjournment

   Motion by Cassandra Howard, supported by Eddie Quinones-Walker, to adjourn. Motion passed 4-0.
   Meeting was adjourned at 7:45 pm.

Respectfully Submitted

Jordan Meagher
Community Development Coordinator
MEMORANDUM

TO: City of Allegan Historic District Commission
FROM: Lori Castello, Zoning Administrator/ Historic Preservation Coordinator
DATE: January 24, 2019
RE: Application- 318 Cutler- Side/rear porch alteration

The Historic District Commission is scheduled to hear a request from Scott Ehrich of First Congregational Church for alterations and repairs to the side/rear porch of the home at 318 Cutler.

Property Information

This property is located 318 Cutler. The estimated building date of this home is unknown. The home lies in the 300 block of Cutler Street between Cedar and Walnut, in the heart of the Pritchards Overlook District. The house itself has vinyl siding. No known installation date for the siding is available.

Information provided by Applicant

The applicant has completed the application to the Historic District Commission and submitted an alteration and repair plan. Also included are photos of the home from the front and an aerial photo showing the surrounding area.

Historic District Handbook Design Guidelines for Porches

Porches help to define the style of the house and serve to frame and protect the entrance of the house. Most of the porches in the City of Allegan were originally constructed of wood. Historic homes built after 1920 typically have concrete porches. The porch columns and balustrade were typically constructed of wood or combinations of wood, brick, stone, or stucco.

1. Porches on front and side facades should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. The porch is on the rear corner of the house, facing the rear yard.

2. The porch in its original design was intended as a focal point for the entrance to the house and should not be removed if original. Enclosure of a porch changes the overall character of a house and should be avoided. Applicant is proposing an alteration to enclose the porch and create a three season room.

3. Enclosure or removal of a porch can make a building façade seem flat. Without a porch there is no transition from sidewalk to house. If a porch must be enclosed, the manner of the enclosure should not destroy the original openness, focus and transition from outside to inside. The use of materials and details compatible with the original character of the house is important in any necessary porch closure. The applicant is proposing enclosure of the rear porch with vinyl siding to match the north and west walls of the house, and add windows and a double patio door with transom.
Sample photos and materials information of doors and windows should be supplied by applicant for more information.

4. Porch details should be retained intact with repair work and replacement of missing parts, such as columns, posts, railings, balusters, decorative molding and trim work to match the original in design, materials, scale and placement. **The proposed alteration would enclose the porch for a three-season room. The corner of the proposed alteration has proposed vertical trim mimicking the trim on the front of the house (see “corner trim photo” on attached plan.**

5. Porch columns and rails should not be replaced by decorative wrought iron. **The corner of the proposed alteration has proposed vertical trim mimicking the trim on the front of the house (see “corner trim photo” on attached plan.**

6. **Surrounding Area:** Single family homes lie adjacent to the house to the north, east and west. Across the street is the First Congregational Church, to which the house presently belongs.

**Conclusion:** Based on the application submitted, the proposed porch alteration and repair project may or may not fit the guidelines for porches within the Historic District. The HDC may choose to approve or suggest alternative work if it finds the application does not meet historic district guidelines. Some of the replacement materials information is not included as recommended, and the applicant has been made aware of this. The Commission may also find that further information is required and postpone a decision if needed. The applicant has been contacted to ask for additional information which will likely be presented to you at the meeting, which may provide more clarity as to whether some standards for approval will be met. I have attached the Standards for Approval to this application with my administrative findings based on information available to me as of today, along with a blank form that I would encourage you to consider individually before discussing and making a group determination.

I hope the information provided is helpful to you as you consider this alteration request. If you have any questions or concerns please do not hesitate to contact me and I will assist in any way that I am able. You may reach me by phone at either (616) 877-2000 Ext. 412 or 1-800-628-3335 or email at lori@pcimi.com.

Thank you for your time.

Sincerely,

Lori Castello
Zoning Administrator/HDC Preservation Coordinator
Sec. 13-57. - Preservation standards.

The standards (Department of Interior Regulations, 36 CFR 67), pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes and occupancy and encompass the exterior related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction. The standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
   The proposed project ___x__ complies ______ does not comply

   Reasons: Property is historically and will continue to be used for residential purposes. While an exterior change is proposed it is upon a back porch area not visible from the street.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
   The proposed project ___x__ complies ______x__ does not comply

   Reasons: The proposed alteration changes the rear of the house and removes a porch that likely was an addition built several years ago (too old for assessing records)

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features of architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
   The proposed project _____ complies ______x__ does not comply

   Reasons: The proposed alteration essentially removes the porch area and changes it into an interior room.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
   The proposed project _____ complies _______x__ does not comply

   Reasons: The proposed alteration removes the historical porch. The porch does not appear original to the home but has likely been there for many years.

5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property [that] shall be preserved.
   The proposed project ___x__ complies ______ does not comply

   Reasons: The proposed alteration does show an attempt to honor the existing trimwork on the front face of the home. In addition, this house has previously been sided with vinyl, which may or may not have already deteriorated any distinctive features.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
   The proposed project _____ complies ______x__ does not comply

   Reasons: There is no evidence that this porch was at one time enclosed.
7. Chemical and physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: Not applicable.*

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: Not applicable.*

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: This house has already been vinyl sided, which means the historic character has already been compromised. From the street, it appears possible that windows have also been replaced with vinyl windows. Conversely, the location looks like it was likely an addition not original to the home—perhaps added on in conjunction with a small interior addition such as a bathroom or kitchen addition. However, the HDC may determine that the porch has been there long enough to attain its own historic value.*

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: The surrounding environment would likely not incur any serious adverse effect—the porch is screened by landscaping from the house to the west, and is not highly visible from the road.*

11. Every reasonable attempt shall be made to preserve structures in a manner which requires minimal alteration to original building design.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: The proposed alteration involved adding exterior walls where open/screened areas have long existed.*

12. Construction or modification work shall not, except where necessary for purposes of safety or efficiency, nullify the distinguishing qualities of the property and its environment. The removal or alteration of architectural features of special historical significance shall be held to a minimum.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*

*Reasons: This house has already been modified from its original appearance. The area visible to neighboring properties and the streetscape is minimally affected. The three season porch will likely provide additional heating and cooling efficiency to the home as well as functionality by providing additional space sheltered from outside elements.*

13. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. Repaired or replaced features shall duplicate original features.

*The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply*
Reasons: The proposed alteration encloses an area not historically enclosed. If windows and doors match or are similar in appearance and materials, this may comply. More information is needed to make a complete determination of this standard.

14. New development, including exterior remodeling, shall:
   a. Respect the architectural and structural integrity of the historic district or site in which work is undertaken through sympathetic use of style, material and color;
   b. Respect the appearance of the streetscape as a whole by harmonizing the design and appearance of the facades of individual structures within the overall design and appearance of the streetscape.
   The proposed project ___x___ complies ______ does not comply.

Reasons: The proposed project encloses an addition to a vinyl sided home in an area not facing the streetscape. The proposed trimwork provides a visual tie to the existing. More information about the materials and style of proposed windows and doors may be required to fully evaluate this standard.

15. Unpainted aluminum and exposed concrete masonry, other than masonry foundations, which are not characteristic of historic districts and sites identified in this chapter are prohibited.
   The proposed project ___x___ complies ______ does not comply

Reasons: No aluminum or masonry is proposed as part of this project.

16. The replacement of lost architectural features with the original feature or features similar to the original shall be strongly encouraged.
   The proposed project ___x___ complies ___x___ does not comply.

Reasons: Unless the HDC determines that this porch which was likely a later addition has been in place long enough to attain its own value, this is not a “lost feature”, and therefore is inapplicable. Should the addition have its own significance, then the project would not comply as an open air (screened) porch is being enclosed.

17. The height, bulk and character of new structures shall be visually compatible with adjacent structures, as defined by the city zoning ordinance.
   The proposed project ___x___ complies ______ does not comply

Reasons: There is no proposed change in footprint or other major alteration that would be subject to further zoning regulations.
1. Address & Parcel # Where Work is to be Performed: 318 Cutler St. #03-51-1 05-1 22-0 0

2. Owner/Applicant Information:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Owner Information</th>
<th>Applicant Information (if different from Property Owner)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Owners Name:</td>
<td>Name: Scott Ehrich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact Name:</td>
<td>Contact Name: Scott Ehrich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address: 323 Cutler</td>
<td>Address: 545 Lane Dr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phone: 269-673-3139</td>
<td>Phone: 269-359-5275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fax:</td>
<td>Fax:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mail Address:</td>
<td>E-mail Address: <a href="mailto:retiredimkeeper1964@gmail.com">retiredimkeeper1964@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Type of Project: ☑ New Construction ☑ Preservation

4. Describe Proposed Project: (Add additional pages if necessary)

1. Remove old rotted screened in porch framing with new construction.
2. Replace any rotten floor joists and flooring with like on same porch.
5. Estimated Cost of the Project: (Please attach all estimates for review (if applicable) $10,000 or approx. $10,000)

6. Documentation: (Please note that all applicable documentation noted below is required before an application will be accepted.)
☑ Photographs showing overall front structure/streetscape;
☑ Site plan/floor plan showing existing structure, street locations, and proposed new elements;
☑ Appearance of proposed project (including elevations and dimensions);
☑ Construction details as needed to explain and clarify the project;
☑ Complete materials list/specification (include type of finishes used if applicable-paint, stain, etc.)

7. Certification and Agreement:

I hereby certify that I will complete the project described herein as approved by Allegan Historic District Commission (AHDC) as required by the Historic Preservation Ordinance (Chapter 13, Allegan Municipal Code). I understand that the AHDC or its Staff will monitor this project to ensure compliance with the approved design. I also authorize the AHDC or its Staff to perform visual inspections as part of the compliance verification process.

Signature of Owner: [Signature]
Print Name: Scott Ehrich Date: Nov 6, 2018

8. RETURN THIS FORM AND SUPPORTING MATERIALS ON OR BEFORE APPLICATION DEADLINE TO:

Professional Code Inspectors – PCI
Lori Castello
1575 142nd Ave.
Dorr, MI 49323
Ph: 616-877-2000 or 1-800-628-3335 Fax: 616-877-4455
E-mail: lorit@pcimi.com

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>Application Deadline (Friday Two Weeks Prior)</th>
<th>HDC Meeting Date (First Monday of the Month) (*except September)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>January 2018</td>
<td>December 27, 2017</td>
<td>January 1, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 2018</td>
<td>January 31, 2018</td>
<td>February 5, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2018</td>
<td>February 28, 2018</td>
<td>March 5, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2018</td>
<td>March 28, 2018</td>
<td>April 2, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2018</td>
<td>May 2, 2018</td>
<td>May 7, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 2018</td>
<td>May 30, 2018</td>
<td>June 4, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 2018</td>
<td>June 27, 2018</td>
<td>July 2, 2018 (Tuesday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2018</td>
<td>August 1, 2018</td>
<td>August 6, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 2018</td>
<td>August 24, 2018</td>
<td>September 4, 2018 (Tuesday)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2018</td>
<td>September 21, 2018</td>
<td>October 1, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 2018</td>
<td>October 26, 2018</td>
<td>November 5, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2018</td>
<td>November 23, 2018</td>
<td>December 3, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 2019</td>
<td>December 28, 2019</td>
<td>January 7, 2019</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>